

My name is Carol Bitting, Marble Falls, Ar.

2015/04/11

#### Comments on Permit #3540-WR-7

Thank you for allowing me to speak, I will try to stay within the 5 minutes but if I go over it won't be for much so please allow me to finish without interruption. This meeting is about addressing our citizen concerns for the environment we live in.

I am here defending my home and the anti-degradation of the waters of this state as specified in Regulation 2 and the Clean Water Act. I am not about new laws, the laws are already here. They are continually degraded though and that is the sadness of this situation as ADEQ has partnered with industry for pollution of the Buffalo River verses the millions of citizens that are financially supporting the agency to protect our resources.

The area I live in is karst, it is downstream of the proposed permit and the water I drink comes from this source. I am also a field technician for Dr Brahana's (KHBNR) study and other ongoing study's of water quality related to the area surrounding the spreading fields of C&H Hog Farms. We have documented the fast transport of groundwater emerging into springs, streams and wells in nearly all directions of the C&H spreading fields and also the continual increase of the decline of water quality in Big Creek.

There are 34 known caves downstream of the EC Campbell farm spreading fields. The above fields are highly erodible allowing nutrients, such as hog waste to pass quickly into the groundwater, caves and streams. It doesn't matter if God made the waste when a cafo comes into a karst community it is no longer about fertilizing fields but about waste management.

Recently I heard Director Keogh state that she knows Big Creek is impaired for e-coli and dissolved oxygen. She did not mention the 30 year partnership with the National Park Service for water quality sampling, she also chose to not use the USGS continuous data and she manipulated the University of Arkansas study by BCRET that shows Big Creek impairment for e-coli. Dr Sharpely refuses to comment on his data for 5 years.

By not listing Big Creek on the 303 (d) list ADEQ would not be required to find the source of degradation to the stream. It could possibly get by without a study of the left fork of Big Creek, Hurricane Creek, the Little Buffalo River etc. to show EC Farms would not impact water quality. This law is stated in Regulation 2 and states it is ADEQ's job to show there will be no pollution to the waters of the state of Arkansas and protect the waters of the Buffalo River under the Clean Water Anti-degradation Act.

Had Mill Creek, Big Creek and Bear Creek been listed on the states 303 (d) impaired waters list there would be funding under Section 319 of the Clean Water Act to find the

source of the pollution and to financially help residents or business' of the county repair the damages and fix the source.

Since 16 of the 17 fields for C&H are above optimum for phosphorus after only 3 years of spreading and Big Creek is impaired (BCRET data, USGS, NPS data) C&H would have to open up its permit to add more fields or remove the hog waste from the area.

Ellis Campbell first wrote in Jan of 2015 asking for a permit transfer. He marked the permit for an active confined feeding operation, and himself as an operator. He stated he had worked this cafo in his past. It wasn't until he received this permit transfer April 1, 2015 that he contacted John Bailey at ADEQ and told him he had no hogs, no waste management system, etc. Neither John Bailey or Ellen Carpenter knew there was no facility attached to this permit and neither sent inspectors to see what they were permitting.

We know that Ellis Campbell has no facility, no land, no waste management system, no equipment and no hogs at the location of the permit, there is no concentrated animal feeding operation, therefore, he cannot have a Regulation 5 permit. Regulation 5.601 pertains to an operator with a confined animal feeding operation who adds application fields to his operation of his cafo. A separate permit must be obtained for waste application only.

The proposed permit is in karst terrain and whether the waste is spread on Big Creek or any other tributary in the Buffalo River watershed in Newton County the waste will appear in the waters of this state and violate the laws and regulations which are designed to protect us as citizens from this pollution.

Please help maintain the quality waters of the Buffalo River that was saved from the damming proposed by the Corp of Engineers and the land that can still be visited by the people who enjoy re-creating within its boundaries.

ADEQ I ask you do not continue with the permitting of this 3540-WR-7.

Carol Bitting  
HC 73 Box 182 A  
Marble Falls, Ar 72648

cc.

Michael Lamoureux, Chief of Staff to Governor Hutchinson.

michael.lamoureux@governor.arkansas.gov

- Arkansas Senator Missy Irvin.

Missy.Irvin@senate.ar.gov

- Arkansas Representative Kelley Linck.

kelley@kelleylinck.com

- Arkansas Representative David Branscum.

david.branscum@hotmail.com

- US Senator John Boozman c/o Phillip Moore.

- US Senator Tom Cotton.

- US Representative Steve Womack

- Arkansas Pollution Control and Ecology Commissioners.

commissioners@adeq.state.ar.us

- Becky Keogh, Director of ADEQ.

keogh@adeq.state.ar.us

- Jeff Crow, Deputy Director, Arkansas Game and Fish Commission.

Jeff.Crow@agfc.ar.gov

- Kane Webb, Director, Arkansas Department of Parks and Tourism.

Kane.Webb@arkansas.gov

- Matt McNair, Environmental Coordinator, Arkansas Department of Parks and Tourism.

Matt.McNair@arkansas.gov

- Nathaniel Smith, MD, MPH, Director and State Health Officer, Arkansas Department of Health.

Nathaniel.Smith@Arkansas.gov

- Randy Young, Director, Arkansas Natural Resource Commission.

Randy.Young@arkansas.gov

- Chris Colclasure, Director, Arkansas Natural Heritage Commission.

chrisc@arkansasheritage.org

**From:** [McWilliams, Katherine](#)  
**To:** [Deardoff, Amy](#)  
**Subject:** FW: ADEQ  
**Date:** Thursday, April 14, 2016 12:18:04 PM  
**Attachments:** [Carol Hearing Comments.pdf](#)

---

---

**From:** Goff, Patricia  
**Sent:** Thursday, April 14, 2016 12:11 PM  
**To:** McWilliams, Katherine  
**Subject:** FW: ADEQ

**From:** Carol Bitting [<mailto:lcbitting@gmail.com>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, April 13, 2016 9:47 PM  
**To:** Bob Ballinger; Charles Armstrong; Denny Altes; Duncan Baird; Eddie Armstrong; John Baine; Jonathan Barnett; Mike Biviano; Nate Bell; Randy Alexander; Richard Womack; Scott Baltz; Warwick Sabin; Alan Clark; Bart Hester; Bill Sample; Bobby Pierce; Bruce Holland; Bruce Maloch; Bryan King; Cecile Bledsoe; David Burnett; David Johnson; David Wyatt; Eddie Cheatham; Eddie Williams; Gary Stubblefield; Greg Standridge; Jake Files; Jane English; Jason Rapert; Jeremy Hutchinson; Jim Hendren; Jimmy Hickey; John Cooper; Johnny Key; Jonathan Dismang; Joyce Elliott; Keith Ingram; Larry Teague; Linda Chesterfield; Linda Collins Smith; Missy Irvin; Robert Thompson; [ronald.caldwell@senate.ar.gov](mailto:ronald.caldwell@senate.ar.gov); Stephanie Flowers; Terry Rice; Uvalde Lindsey; [michael.lamoureux@governor.arkansas.gov](mailto:michael.lamoureux@governor.arkansas.gov); [david.branscum@hotmail.com](mailto:david.branscum@hotmail.com); Commissioners; [Jeff.Crow@agfc.ar.gov](mailto:Jeff.Crow@agfc.ar.gov); [Kane.Webb@arkansas.gov](mailto:Kane.Webb@arkansas.gov); [Matt.McNair@arkansas.gov](mailto:Matt.McNair@arkansas.gov); [Nathaniel.Smith@arkansas.gov](mailto:Nathaniel.Smith@arkansas.gov); [Randy.Young@arkansas.gov](mailto:Randy.Young@arkansas.gov); [chris@arkansasheritage.org](mailto:chris@arkansasheritage.org)  
**Subject:** ADEQ

Please read my attached letter. This area can never be reclaimed once it is destroyed. Unfortunately ADEQ and industry have already begun to whittle away at what Congress set aside for preservation, the Buffalo National River. ADEQ, SBA & the FSA has had thousands of comments over the last 3 years from citizens and not one comment has made a difference in the permitting process. ADEQ plans to permit another Reg 5 permit for 6.6 million gallons in Newton County due to the contamination of Big Creek since the fields are already saturated with hog waste from C&H Hog Farms. The spreading of millions of gallons began on fields aligning Big Creek less than 3 years ago. This area is not capable of utilizing millions of gallons of hog waste.

The comment period is closed, but few people are aware of what is happening. Can you help? Will you help?

Sincerely,  
Carol Bitting  
See attached letter

*"Wilderness is not a luxury but a necessity of the human spirit, and as vital to our lives as water and good bread."*  
*Edward Abby*